CANADA WATCH FALL 2022

Myths, Damn Myths, and Voting System Change: How Canadian Political Scientists Misrepresent Democratic Reform

CONTENTS

Abstract	1
Introduction	1
1. Framing the debate over voting system reform	3
Ideal types versus party self-interest	3
2. Debunking the myths of the preference approach	4
2.1 Simplicity	5
2.2 Stability	5
2.3 Representation	6
2.4 Accountability	7
3. The democratization approach: Matching institutions to actions	8
3.1 What voters say	8
3.2 What voters do	9
3.3 Why voters choose parties	9
4. Critically assessing referenda	10
4.1 Majoritarian decision rules and representation	11
4.2 Voting system reform and referenda	11
4.3 Normative versus partisan interests and referenda	11
4.4 Voters, issue complexity, and referenda	12
4.5 Values and voting system choice	14
4.6 The problem of "choosing" unfairness	14
5. A more democratic process of voting system reform	15
Conclusion	17
Notes	17



EDITOR

Jean Michel Montsion, Director Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies, York University

MANAGING EDITOR

Laura Taman, Coordinator Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies, York University

COLUMNIST IN THIS ISSUE

Dennis Pilon, Politics, York University

PRODUCTION

ReWords Editorial & Production Services

CONTACT FOR INFORMATION

Canada Watch 7th Floor, Kaneff Tower 4700 Keele St., Toronto, Ontario M3J 1P3 Phone 416-736-5499, Fax 416-650-8069 http://robarts.info.yorku.ca

For information regarding future issues, contact Laura Taman, Coordinator, Robarts Centre.

Please address comments to Jean Michel Montsion, Director, Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies.

Canada Watch is produced by the Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies of York University.

Copyright © 2022 The Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies

ISSN 1191-7733



The Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies and



LEARN MORE AT:

http://robarts.info.yorku.ca



2 CANADA WATCH • FALL 2022